Scaling Up Best Practices in Intra-Household Individual-Disaggregated Survey Data Collection: LSMS+ Program

Talip Kilic  
Senior Economist  
Living Standards Measurement Study  
Development Data Group | World Bank  
tkilic@worldbank.org

Heather Moylan  
Survey Specialist  
Living Standards Measurement Study  
Development Data Group | World Bank  
hmoylan@worldbank.org
Gender equality is smart economics

Persistent gender inequities in economic and social life
Gender equality is smart economics

Persistent gender inequities in economic and social life

Individual-disaggregated data at the heart of
- Research that informs policies targeting gender inequities
Gender equality is smart economics

Persistent gender inequities in economic and social life

Individual-disaggregated data at the heart of
- Research that informs policies targeting gender inequities
- Monitoring progress towards the SDGs to end poverty, achieve gender equality and ensure decent work
Gender equality is smart economics

Persistent gender inequities in economic and social life

Individual-disaggregated data at the heart of
- Research that informs policies targeting gender inequities
- Monitoring progress towards the SDGs to end poverty, achieve gender equality and ensure decent work

Household surveys: an important source of these data, but with significant room for improvement
- Reliance on “most knowledgeable member”, proxy respondents and/or non-private interviews
Figure 1: Rate of **Proxy Respondent Use** in Individual-Level Labor Data Collection in World Bank LSMS-ISA-Supported National Surveys - Age Group: 15-64

Overall | Male | Female
---|---|---
Malawi (2017) | 45 | 55 | 36
Niger (2014) | 42 | 38 | 24
Nigeria (2016) | 24 | 28 | 21
Tanzania (2013) | 24 | 30 | 18
Mali (2014) | 85 | 71 | 98
Uganda (2014) | 56 | 66 | 47
Background

➢ Momentum has been building to improve the foundations of individual-disaggregated survey data
Background

Momentum has been building to improve the foundations of individual-disaggregated survey data

Ownership of and rights to physical and financial assets

- UN Guidelines for Producing Statistics on Asset Ownership from a Gender Perspective (2019)

- Measuring Individuals’ Rights to Land: Guidelines for Integrated Data Collection for SDG 1.4.2 and 5.a.1 (2019)
Background

➢ Momentum has been building to improve the foundations of individual-disaggregated survey data

➢ Ownership of and rights to physical and financial assets
  – UN Guidelines for Producing Statistics on Asset Ownership from a Gender Perspective (2019)
  – Measuring Individuals’ Rights to Land: Guidelines for Integrated Data Collection for SDG 1.4.2 and 5.a.1 (2019)

➢ Work and employment
Background

- Momentum has been building to improve the foundations of individual-disaggregated survey data

- Ownership of and rights to physical and financial assets
  - UN Guidelines for Producing Statistics on Asset Ownership from a Gender Perspective (2019)
  - Measuring Individuals’ Rights to Land: Guidelines for Integrated Data Collection for SDG 1.4.2 and 5.a.1 (2019)

- Work and employment

- World Bank IDA18 commitment to “pilot data collection (..) in at least six IDA countries to gather direct respondent, intra-household level information on employment and assets”
The LSMS+ Program

http://surveys.worldbank.org/lsms/programs/lsms-plus
LSMS+: Objectives

A partnership between Development Data Group and Gender Group – at start, to meet the IDA18 gender data commitment
LSMS+: Objectives

A partnership between Development Data Group and Gender Group – at start, to meet the IDA18 gender data commitment

- Data Production
  - Provide financial support for implementing best practices on individual-disaggregated survey data collection on asset ownership and employment as part of national surveys in 6 IDA-eligible countries
  - Aim to interview all adult household members in private, with enumerator-respondent gender match and simultaneous intra-household interviews, if possible
  - Publicly disseminate unit-record, fully-documented individual-disaggregated household survey datasets
LSMS+: Objectives

A partnership between **Development Data Group** and **Gender Group** – at start, to meet the IDA18 gender data commitment

- **Data Production**
  - Provide financial support for implementing best practices on individual-disaggregated survey data collection on asset ownership and employment as part of national surveys in 6 IDA-eligible countries
  - Aim to interview all adult household members in private, with enumerator-respondent gender match and simultaneous intra-household interviews, if possible
  - Publicly disseminate unit-record, fully-documented individual-disaggregated household survey datasets

- **Technical Assistance**
  - Enhance NSO capacity in individual-disaggregated (CAPI) survey design, fieldwork implementation, analysis
LSMS+: Objectives

A partnership between Development Data Group and Gender Group – at start, to meet the IDA18 gender data commitment

- **Data Production**
  - Provide financial support for implementing best practices on individual-disaggregated survey data collection on asset ownership and employment as part of national surveys in 6 IDA-eligible countries
    - Aim to interview all adult household members in private, with enumerator-respondent gender match and simultaneous intra-household interviews, if possible
  - Publicly disseminate unit-record, fully-documented individual-disaggregated household survey datasets

- **Technical Assistance**
  - Enhance NSO capacity in individual-disaggregated (CAPI) survey design, fieldwork implementation, analysis

- **Research and Dissemination**
  - Support policy and methodological survey research
  - Provide updated methodological and operational guidance on individual-disaggregated survey data collection
### LSMS+: Overview of National Surveys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Malawi*</th>
<th>Tanzania*</th>
<th>Ethiopia*</th>
<th>Cambodia*</th>
<th>Nepal</th>
<th>Sudan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>LSMS+ Sample Size</strong></td>
<td>2,508</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>7,200</td>
<td>1,512</td>
<td>756</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Topics of Individual-Disaggregated Data Collection</strong></td>
<td>Asset ownership, employment, non-farm enterprises, education, health, food insecurity</td>
<td>Asset ownership, employment, non-farm enterprises, education, health</td>
<td>Asset ownership, employment, non-farm enterprises, education, health</td>
<td>Asset ownership, employment, non-farm enterprises, education, health, time use, internal and international migration</td>
<td>Asset ownership, employment, non-farm enterprises, education, health, time use, internal and international migration</td>
<td>Asset ownership, employment, non-farm enterprises, education, health, time use, internal and international migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Data Dissemination</strong></td>
<td>Nov ‘17</td>
<td>July ‘20</td>
<td>July ‘20</td>
<td>July ‘20</td>
<td>Sept ‘20</td>
<td>Dec ‘21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:** * LSMS+ supported surveys in Malawi, Tanzania, Ethiopia, Cambodia, and Nepal are implemented using the World Bank Survey Solutions Computer-Assisted Personal Interviewing (CAPI) Software Platform.
### LSMS+: Scope of Asset Data Collection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset Classes</th>
<th>Reported Ownership</th>
<th>Economic Ownership</th>
<th>Documented Ownership</th>
<th>Rights**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land*</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Accounts*</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobile Phones*</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apartments/Condos</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durables</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* These three asset classes were included in all LSMS+ countries

** Bundle of Rights includes: Right to Sell, Right to Bequeath, Right to Rent Out, Right to Use as Collateral, Right to Make Improvements/Invest

- Unique identification of any joint owners/rights holders – both inside and outside the household
- Capture capacity to exercise rights independently by asking permission/consent provider(s)
LSMS+: Structure of Asset Data Collection

Do you own this [PARCEL], either alone or jointly with someone else?

- **YES**
  - Does anyone **inside the household** jointly own this [PARCEL] with you?
    - **YES**
      - List the household members
    - **NO**

- **NO**
  - NEXT PARCEL

---

EXAMPLE: REPORTED OWNERSHIP FOR LAND

---

- **YES**, report the # of males and females
  - NO
    - NEXT OWNERSHIP CONSTRUCT
LSMS+: **Scope of Employment & Enterprise Data Collection**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment</th>
<th>7-day</th>
<th>30-day</th>
<th>12 Months</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Screening Questions</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intended Destination (Farming Only)</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment/Job Search</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Wage Job</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Wage Job</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search for More/ Different Work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Enterprise</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linked to Employment Module</td>
<td>Link to Employment Module</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Enterprise Attributes</td>
<td>Basic Enterprise Attributes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonality in Enterprise Ops (Last 12 Months)</td>
<td>Seasonality in Enterprise Ops (Last 12 Months)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household &amp; Hired Labor Inputs (Last Month)</td>
<td>Household &amp; Hired Labor Inputs (Last Month)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profits, Revenues, Costs (Last Month)</td>
<td>Profits, Revenues, Costs (Last Month)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LSMS+: Malawi Experience

Two national surveys implemented concurrently allowed for comparative analysis of data from a cross-sectional (“most knowledgeable respondent, business-as-usual”) vs. panel sample (LSMS+ “gold standard approach”)

**LSMS+ Overall Success Rate:**
79% of targeted individuals interviewed

**Gender Match-up:**
80.7% of male respondents paired w/ male enumerators
73.2% for female respondents

**Private Interviews:**
99% - Across Modules

<p>| Table 1. Distribution of IHPS Households According to Number of Adults Interviewed |
|---------------------------------|----------------|-----|</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Panel</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Households Interviewed</td>
<td></td>
<td>2477</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Eligible Adults Interviewed</td>
<td></td>
<td>1675</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 adults</td>
<td></td>
<td>115</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 adults</td>
<td></td>
<td>225</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 adults</td>
<td></td>
<td>1003</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 adult</td>
<td></td>
<td>332</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subset of Eligible Adults Interviewed</td>
<td></td>
<td>802</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 out of 4</td>
<td></td>
<td>106</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 out of 4</td>
<td></td>
<td>92</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 out of 4</td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 out of 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>167</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 out of 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>65</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 out of 2</td>
<td></td>
<td>343</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average # of Adults Interviewed</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Malawi: Effects of Business-As-Usual Approach vis-à-vis LSMS+

Getting the (Gender-Disaggregated) Lay of the Land

Impact of Survey Respondent Selection on Measuring Land Ownership and Rights

Tuğçe Kilic
Heather Meylan
Ceyati Keshavai


Substantial agreement exists on agricultural landowners and rights holders, as reported by the privately-interviewed spouses.

Discrepancies emerge when greater household status for women is positively associated with women attributing at least some land ownership to themselves.

Reporting on assets (agricultural land)

Men

Higher levels of exclusive reported & economic ownership

Women

Lower levels of joint reported and economic ownership
Malawi: Effects of Business-As-Usual Approach vis-à-vis LSMS+

Are You Being Asked?
Impacts of Respondent Selection on Measuring Employment

Talip Kili
Gwladys Van den Broeck
Gopinath Ravallion
Heather Meylan


Reporting on labor outcomes

Men
- Lower reported wage employment
- Lower weekly hours in crop agriculture

Women
- Higher weekly hours in wage employment

Lower reported employment in livestock and NFE activity (supporting as well as managing), and weekly hours in livestock (stronger effects for women, and for 12-month vs. 7 day recall)

linked with HH wealth, proxy reporting, and potential difficulties interpreting questions on NFEs
LSMS+ Program: Pipeline Outputs

- **Country Datasets**: Tanzania, Ethiopia, Cambodia, Nepal, and Sudan

- **Cross-country Report**: Results from Malawi, Tanzania, Ethiopia (June ‘20)
  - Gender gaps in asset ownership, employment, and cross-country comparable SDG outcomes
  - Intra-household discrepancies in reporting on ownership of and rights to assets
  - Operational and methodological guidance anchored in field experience and research

- **Country-specific Reports**: Results from Cambodia, Nepal, and Sudan (Jul ‘20 - June ‘21)

- **Research papers**: Extent of and drivers of gender gaps in labor market outcomes, with a focus on exploring the role of gender differences in asset ownership and time use (Jul ‘20 – June ‘21)
Thank You

http://surveys.worldbank.org/lsms/programs/lsms-plus